Enumeration and universality classes of colored triangulations (for quantum gravity)



Valentin Bonzom

with R. Gurau, V. Rivasseau, L. Lionni, S. Dartois, A. Tanasa

LIPN – Sorbonne Paris Nord IRIF – Université de Paris

June 23-24, 2021 **8ECM Applied Combinatorial and Geometric Topology** (MS - ID 34)

First half

- Trees and combinatorial maps
- Diversality classes
- Enumeration and scaling limit
- Model for questions in higher dimensions

Second half

- Some 3D models
- ▷ Enumeration for colored triangulations which maximize the number of (d - 2)-simplices at fixed number of d-simplices
 [VB + others mentioned in title slide]

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQで

Review material except last part

Combinatorial maps

Take polygons and glue into closed surface



Properly embedded graphs

- ▷ No crossing & up to deformation
- Graph complement is disjoint union of disks
- Each disk: a face







- ▷ Vertices, edges and faces
- \triangleright Other def: factorization of permutations \rightarrow Hurwitz numbers
- ▷ **Euler's formula**: Genus *h* is determined combinatorially

$$\#$$
faces $- \#$ edges $+ \#$ vertices $= 2 - 2h$, $h \ge 0$

▷ For triangulations $V \le 2 + F/2$ Linear bound on number of vertices Equivalence in 2D

Sphere \Leftrightarrow Genus 0 \Leftrightarrow Maximize V at fixed F

Not true in higher dimensions!

Families of maps and trees

- General maps, triangulations, quadrangulations, bipartite maps, hypermaps
- ▷ Enumeration [Tutte 60s] $Q_n = \frac{2 \cdot 3^n}{(n+2)(n+1)} {2n \choose n} \sim_{n \to \infty} \frac{2}{\sqrt{\pi}} 12^n n^{-5/2}$
- Geometry: graph distance, dual graph distance, etc. How do distances scale with the size? (very active topic last 20 years)

Trees

- $\triangleright~$ Graphs without cycle
- Enumeration w.r.t. number (internal) nodes
- Also geometric objects: graph distance
- Also multiple families: plane trees, binary, etc.



Do trees or maps from different families behave similarly? Not exactly but at large scales?

Universality

- Common asymptotic and geometric features?
- Macroscopic quantities independent of microscopic details of model
- Develop universal features at large scales
- We do not see the individual polygons anymore
- Collective behavior due to gluing
- \triangleright For "reasonable" family $\mathcal T$ of trees

$$T_n \sim \underbrace{\mathcal{K}_{\mathcal{T}}}_{\text{Constant}} \underbrace{\mathcal{P}_{\mathcal{T}}^{-n}}_{\text{Exp growth}} n^{-3/2}$$

 $\begin{cases} K_{\mathcal{T}} \& \rho_{\mathcal{T}} \text{ non-universal} \\ \text{exponent } -3/2 \text{ universal} \end{cases}$

 $\triangleright~$ For reasonable family of maps \mathcal{M}_{r}

$$M_n \sim K_{\mathcal{M}} \ \rho_{\mathcal{M}}^{-n} \ n^{-5/2}$$

Universality in the continuum limit

 \triangleright Size $n \to \infty$: asymptotics

 $\triangleright\,$ Edge length $a \rightarrow 0$, so that distances remain finite: scaling behavior

$$a \sim n^{-1/2}$$
 for trees, $a \sim n^{-1/4}$ for maps

Scaling limit of random trees

- > Aldous' thm: convergence to the continuous random tree
- ▷ Distances scale like \sqrt{n} , Hausdorff dim $d_H = 2$
- Almost surely binary



Simulation by I. Kortchemski

Scaling limit of random planar maps

- ▷ Le Gall's & Miermont's thm: convergence to the Brownian sphere
- ▷ Distances scale like $n^{\frac{1}{4}}$, Hausdorff dim $d_H = 4$
- > Almost surely homeomorphic to 2-sphere



Simulation by I. Kortchemski – 3D rendering on Bettinelli's page

Some classes of random geometry

▷ Watabiki's prediction
$$d_H = 2 \frac{\sqrt{25-c} + \sqrt{49-c}}{\sqrt{25-c} + \sqrt{1-c}}$$

Species	Asymptotics	d _H	Scaling limit	
Trees	n ^{-3/2}	2	Continuous random tree [Aldous]	
Planar	n ^{-5/2}	4	Brownian sphere [Le Gall & Miermont]	
Planar + spanning tree	n ⁻³	$\frac{3+\sqrt{17}}{2}$?	??	
Planar + Ising	n ^{-7/3}	$\frac{7+\sqrt{97}}{4}$?	Huge open problem	
Meanders	$n^{-\frac{29+\sqrt{145}}{12}}?$		Conjecture [Di Francesco-Golinelli-Guitter]	
Feuilletages		$(2^k)_{k\geq 1}$	[Marckert-Lionni]	

(ロ)、(型)、(E)、(E)、(E)、(O)へ(C)

In higher dimensions

- Difficult to find a model both solvable and non-trivial!
- Dopology and combinatorics of triangulations is more difficult
- ▷ Can we recover results from 3D gravity by summing triangulations?
- Universality required if this is viable approach to quantum gravity

Some difficulties

- \triangleright No topological classification using a single integer
- ▷ Euler characteristic vanishes for all orientable 3-manifolds
- Matrix integral approach generalize to tensor integrals, but no eigenvalues
- Setup to investigate universality
- Generalize triangulations, quadrangulations, etc. to higher dim. families

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ■ ●の00

- $\triangleright\,$ Need to generalize polygons to building blocks
- $\triangleright\,$ Still maintaining combin. control enough to enumerate

"Gromov" question

- Is the number of 3d triangulations of the sphere exponentially bounded w.r.t. number of tetrahedra?
- \triangleright Rivasseau's bound $n!^{1/3}$ using colored triangulations
- ▷ Chapuy-Perarnau's refinement n!^{1/6} Exact for 3-manifolds!
- Numerical simulations and sub-families...

Numerical simulations – Euclidean Dynamical Triangulations

- Monte-Carlo simulations found two phases
- A phase which maximizes the number of edges corresponding to trees
- A phase which minimizes the number of edges with few vertices (crumbled)

Sub-families of triangulations

Stack-spheres

- $\triangleright~$ Built by 1 \rightarrow 4 moves on tetrahedra at random
- Scaling limit is Aldous' CRT [Albenque-Marckert, Gurau-Ryan]

Locally constructible

- $\triangleright\,$ Take a tree of tetrahedra and only glue adjacent faces
- Locally constructible triangulations [Durhuus-Jonsson]
- LCT are exponentially bounded
- Benedetti & Ziegler proved that not all spheres are LC

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{c} \mathsf{vertex} \\ \mathsf{decomposable} \end{array} \right\} \subsetneq \{\mathsf{shellable}\} \subseteq \{\mathsf{constructible}\} \subsetneq \{\mathsf{LC}\} \subsetneq \{\mathsf{3}\text{-spheres}\}$$

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ■ ●の00

Monte-Carlo in progress [private comm. Budd-Lionni]

Combinatorial classification

▷ Euler's genus formula for 2*p*-angulations

$$V(T) - (p-1)F(T) = 2 - 2g(T) \le 2$$

Which set of triangulations to generalize? Colored triangulations
Gurau's theorem on colored triangulations

▷ Bound on number of (d - 2)-simplices

$$\Delta_{d-2}(T) - rac{d(d-1)}{4}\Delta_d(T) = d - \omega(T) \leq d$$

- $\triangleright \ \omega(\mathcal{T}) = 2g(\mathcal{T})$ for 2D colored triangulations
- \triangleright Not a topological invariant in $d \ge 3$
- Genuine combinatorial extensions of genus!
- \triangleright Gurau–Schaeffer classification w.r.t. $\omega(T)$
- Investigate universality classes?



Induced colorings

 \triangleright Faces colored $0, 1, \ldots, d$



(日) (四) (日) (日) (日)

Induced colorings

- \triangleright Faces colored $0, 1, \ldots, d$
- ▷ (d-2)-simplices labeled by pairs of colors $\{a, b\}$



▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQで

Induced colorings

- \triangleright Faces colored $0, 1, \ldots, d$
- ▷ (d-2)-simplices labeled by pairs of colors $\{a, b\}$
- ▷ (d-3)-simplices labeled by triples of colors $\{a, b, c\}$



▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ □ のQで

Induced colorings

- \triangleright Faces colored $0, 1, \dots, d$
- ▷ (d-2)-simplices labeled by pairs of colors $\{a, b\}$
- ▷ (d-3)-simplices labeled by triples of colors $\{a, b, c\}$
- \triangleright (d k)-simplices labeled by k-uple of colors

Attaching map

Unique gluing which respects all subcolorings



Gluing determined by face color

▷ Graphical representation



Attaching map

Unique gluing which respects all subcolorings



Gluing determined by face color

Graphical representation



(d-2)-simplices and bicolored cyles



d = 3

(ロ)、

(d-2)-simplices and bicolored cyles



d = 3

(ロ)、(型)、(E)、(E)、(E)、(O)へ(C)

Bipartite 2*p*-angulations



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆三▶ ◆三▶ ◆□▶

Bipartite 2*p*-angulations



▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三三 のへ⊙

Bipartite 2*p*-angulations



Bipartite 2*p*-angulations



(日) (四) (日) (日) (日)

- \triangleright 2*p*-gon is dual to a cycle with colors $\{1,2\}$
- ▷ Color 0 used to glue 2*p*-gons together

Generalizing polygons

Colored building blocks and dual bubbles

- \triangleright Boundary made of (d-1)-simplices of color 0
- $\triangleright~$ Cone over bdry triangulation \rightarrow 1 internal vertex, of colors $1,\ldots,d$
- ▷ Dual graph called **bubble**: connected, all colors except 0
- Edges of color 0 glue bubbles together
- Investigate universality!



Some theorems

- ▷ All PL-manifolds admit a colored triangulation
- ▷ See following talks by P. Cristofori and M. R. Casali
- Represent a manifold iff c.c. obtained by removing a color are all spheres
- Orientability iff colored graph is bipartite
- ▷ Topological studies ([L. Grasselli,P. Cristofori and M. R. Casali]) but little enumeration until 2010!

In combinatorics and math-ph

- Tensor integral to generate colored triangulation via Feynman rules (GFT context [Gurau])
- \triangleright Large N limit and combinatorial extension of the genus to higher d
- More large N limits in tensor models and connection to SYK model [Benedetti-Carrozza-Ferrari-Gurau-Harribey-Klebanov, etc.]

- Some universality classes [VB-Lionni-Thürigen]
- \triangleright Beyond large *N*, e.g. higher genus & topological recursion
- ▷ GFT renormalization at all orders in perturbation theory

Enumeration of 3D colored triangulations

Thm [VB]

- ▷ Take any set of colored building blocks homeomorphic to 3-balls
- Which gluings maximize the number of edges?
- $\triangleright \text{ Topologically: 3-spheres } \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} \text{Combinatorially: bijection with trees} \\ \bullet & & & \\ \circ & & & \\ \circ & & & \\ \bullet & & \\ \bullet & & \\ \bullet & & \\ B \end{array} } \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} \circ v_1 & \circ \\ v_5 & \pi(v_5) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_5)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_3) \end{array} }_{\bullet & \\ \bullet & \\ \bullet & \\ \bullet & \\ \hline \end{array} } \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} \circ & v_1 \\ v_5 & \pi(v_5) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_5)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_3) \end{array} }_{\bullet & \\ \bullet & \\ \hline \end{array} } \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} \circ & v_1 \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_2) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_3) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_3) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_3) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_3) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_2) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_4)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_2) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \bullet \\ \tau(v_2) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_5 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_3 \circ \\ \tau(v_6) & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \underbrace{ \begin{array}{c} v_6 & \tau(v_6) \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6)} \end{array} }_{v_6 & \pi(v_6) \end{array} }_{$
- ▷ What about the bound? Example: octahedra [VB-Lionni]

 $\mathsf{Edges}(T) \leq 3 + 11\mathsf{Oct}(T)$ vs $\mathsf{Gurau's}$ $\mathsf{Edges}(T) \leq 3 + 12\mathsf{Oct}(T)$

- Bound is not universal
- Triangulations which saturate the bond exhibit universality

Surprise

 $\triangleright\,$ In even dim. universality class depends on building blocks

>	d = 4		
	Building block Maximize # triangles		
	$2 \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 3 \\ 4 \\ 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 \\ 4 \\ 3 \end{pmatrix} 2$ Trees		
		Planar maps	Reproduce all 2D behaviors
	Mix	Trees of baby universes	

◆□ ▶ ◆□ ▶ ◆ 臣 ▶ ◆ 臣 ▶ ○ 臣 ○ のへで

Summary

- Investigate universality classes of discretized PL-manifolds
- \triangleright Combinatorial maps = 2D quantum gravity
- Colored triangulations are nice objects to investigate universality classes in higher dimensions
- Genuine combinatorial generalization of Euler's relation
- ▷ Maximize number of (D 2)-simplices
- No new universality classes (yet)
- ▷ Need different guiding principles, more focus on topology?
- Other families offering nice meeting ground for topology and combinatorics?

▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲□▶ ■ ●の00

Geometry of colored triangulations?

Dual colored 1-skeleton

Colored Duality



Dual colored 1-skeleton

Colored Duality



Dual colored 1-skeleton

Colored Duality



(d-3)-simplices and tricolored components

d = 3

- Octahedron made of 8 colored tetrahedra
- ▷ All boundary faces have color 0
- ▷ All internal triangles have colors 1, 2, 3
- \triangleright Single internal vertex of color $\{1, 2, 3\}$
- \triangleright Dual: cube with colored edges 1, 2, 3



◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ ○臣 - のへで

Colored Building blocks



▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三三 のへで

Cones

- $\triangleright \text{ Boundary} \Leftrightarrow \text{Faces of color 0}$
- Displaying the second secon
- ▷ Single interior vertex $v_{1...d}$

Colored Building blocks



▲□▶ ▲□▶ ▲三▶ ▲三▶ 三三 のへで

Duals

- \triangleright Dual to boundary = Dual to CBB with 0 removed
- \triangleright Graph with colors 1, ..., *d* called **bubble**
- $\triangleright~$ Same as colored graphs but without 0

Colored Building blocks



Proposition in 3D

- ▷ Dual to boundary is a map: Canonical embedding of bubble
- ▷ Colored building block homeomorphic to 3-ball ⇔ Planar bubble
- ▷ We will be able to use properties of planar maps!

Example of graphs

In 3D graphs are 4-regular with colored edges



- $\triangleright~4$ c.c. with colors $\{1,2,3\} \rightarrow 4$ vertices of colors $\{1,2,3\}$ in triangulation
- \triangleright $C_{0a}(G)$ number of **bicolored cycles** with colors $\{0, a\}$

$$C_0(G) = \sum_{a=1}^{3} C_{0a}(G)$$
 dual to $(d-2)$ -simplices

Example of graphs

In 3D graphs are 4-regular with colored edges



- $\triangleright~4$ c.c. with colors $\{1,2,3\} \rightarrow 4$ vertices of colors $\{1,2,3\}$ in triangulation
- \triangleright $C_{0a}(G)$ number of **bicolored cycles** with colors $\{0, a\}$

$$C_0(G) = \sum_{a=1}^3 C_{0a}(G) \qquad \text{dual to } (a)$$

dual to (d-2)-simplices